

Lesson 3.2

THINK, PAIR, SHARE: IS ALL FAIR IN WAR?

Objective: Students will analyze and evaluate the justness of the 1755 Proclamation issued by the Massachusetts Bay Government that set bounties on the heads of Penobscot men, women, and children.

Materials:

- **Doc 3.2:** 1755 Bounty Proclamation, (same as Doc 3.2B)

Timing: One class period

Background Reading:

- Chapter Three, Sections Three-Four

Procedure:

1. Give each student a copy of the 1755 Bounty Proclamation. Review with students what was happening in Maine at this time: English settlers had encroached on much of Wabanaki land; many Indians had been killed, many were starving, and most had been pushed inland and north to Canada; England and France were fighting the French and Indian War; and Louisbourg had been taken in 1745.
2. Split students up into pairs. Have them read the document in their pairs, looking up any words they do not understand. Explain that the letter "s" will look like the letter "f" in this document, but that not all "f's" look like "s's."
3. Discuss the document together, making sure everyone understands its purpose. If you have not done the Hunting for Bias lesson with students (included in this chapter), you may wish to hold a discussion here about bias in historical documents, and how it is necessary to consider the point of view a document represents in order to get a fuller picture.
4. Explain the rules for Think, Pair, Share discussions:
 - a. You (the teacher) will ask the entire class a question.
 - b. Each person will have a minute to think about his or her own response to the question.
 - c. Then, each pair will have a minute to share their responses with each other. You may not interrupt each other--each person gets the full thirty seconds. You must respond with substance--you won't get away with saying "I don't know." Walk around the room during the pair sharing time, helping those who have a hard time articulating their thoughts.
 - d. Finally, the question will be opened up to the whole class. Call on a variety of people to share their responses to the question. Try to make sure everyone gets a chance to contribute to the discussion by the end of the class.

3. Prepare a list of analytical and evaluative questions about the Proclamation. Here are some suggestions:

- Why does Spencer Phips call the Penobscot Indians traitors to King George?
- Phips says he does "hereby require" all English subjects to take any opportunity they can to pursue, captivate, and kill Penobscot Indians. What does the word "require" imply? Is this a just decision on his part?
- Why do you think Phips will pay less for a scalp than for a captive Penobscot?
- Why will he pay less for woman and children than for men?
- Is it just to put a bounty on the heads of children?
- A common practice by Wabanaki tribes during war was to take captives. While some of the captives lived and worked among the Wabanaki tribes, some were tortured or even killed. Is this a fair war practice?
- What qualifies as a war crime? What constitutes "fairness" in war?
- Can war ever be just?

****Note:** As an alternative, you may wish to have students come up with a list of questions for each other, based on this document. Encourage them to read the document carefully, and write down three questions that they feel the documents raises. Students can then discuss their own questions in pairs, and finally bring their questions to the larger group for consideration.

4. Assign students an essay: You are a judge in the Massachusetts Bay Colony in 1755. You have just come across this Proclamation issued by Spencer Phips. Write an opinion piece of about 1 page expressing whether or not you believe these bounties to be fair. Support your opinion with evidence. Be clear and thorough.

Evaluation: Grade student opinion papers based on clarity, thoroughness, and thoughtfulness. Students may choose to include their papers in their final Unit 1 portfolio.

Follow up activity:

- Research war crimes in more contemporary wars, such as the conflict in Iraq or the Israel-Palestine war. Have students write a paper exploring the question: Is all fair in war? or Is war ever just?

Alignment with the Learning Results:

Grade Level: **6th-8th**

Content Area: Social Studies: **APPLICATIONS**

Standard: **Researching and Developing Positions on Current Social Studies Issues**

Students research, select, and present a position on a current social studies issue by proposing and revising research questions, and locating and selecting information from multiple and varied sources.

Descriptor **A1c:** Locate and access relevant information that includes multiple perspectives from varied source



By His HONOUR

S P E N C E R P H I P S, Esq;

Lieutenant-Governour and Commander in Chief, in and over His Majesty's Province of the *Massachusetts-Bay* in *New-England*.

A P R O C L A M A T I O N.

WHEREAS the Tribe of *Penobscot* Indians have repeatedly in a perfidious Manner acted contrary to their solemn Submissiion unto His Majesty long since made and frequently renewed ;

I have therefore, at the Desire of the house of Representatives, with the Advice of His Majesty's Council, thought fit to issue this Proclamation, and to declare the *Penobscot* Tribe of Indians to be Enemies, Rebels and Traitors to His Majesty King *GEORGE* the Second : And I do hereby require His Majesty's Subjects of this Province to embrace all Opportunities of pursuing, captivating, killing and destroying all and every of the aforesaid Indians.

AND WHEREAS the General Court of this Province have voted that a Bounty or Encouragement be granted and allowed to be paid out of the Publick Treasury, to the marching Forces that shall have been employed for the Defence of the *Eastern* and *Western* Frontiers, from the *First* to the *Twenty-fifth* of this Instant *November* ;

I have thought fit to publish the same ; and I do hereby promise, That there shall be paid out of the Province-Treasury to all and any of the said Forces, over and above their Bounty upon Enlistment, their Wages and Subsistence, the Premiums or Bounty following, viz.

For every Male *Penobscot* Indian above the Age of Twelve Years, that shall be taken within the Time aforesaid and brought to *Boston*, *Fifty Pounds*.

For every Scalp of a Male *Penobscot* Indian above the Age aforesaid, brought in as Evidence of their being killed as aforesaid, *Forty Pounds*.

For every Female *Penobscot* Indian taken and brought in as aforesaid, and for every Male Indian Prisoner under the Age of Twelve Years, taken and brought in as aforesaid, *Twenty-five Pounds*.

For every Scalp of such Female Indian or Male Indian under the Age of Twelve Years, that shall be killed and brought in as Evidence of their being killed as aforesaid, *Twenty Pounds*.

Given at the Council-Chamber in *Boston*, this Third Day of *November* 1755, and in the Twenty-ninth Year of the Reign of our Sovereign Lord *GEORGE* the Second, by the Grace of GOD of *Great-Britain*, *France* and *Ireland*, KING, Defender of the Faith, &c.

By His Honour's Command,
J. Willard, Secr.

S. Phips.

G O D Save the **K I N G.**

B O S T O N: Printed by *Jobs Draper*, Printer to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governour and Council. 1755.

Image Courtesy of: Massachusetts Historical Society • www.masshist.org